

# Summary of Construction Options

## Downtown Santa Cruz Library

Report from the Downtown Library Advisory Committee (DLAC)

### Introduction

This draft document summarizes each of the four construction options for the downtown Santa Cruz library discussed during the DLAC meetings. None of the options comes in under the \$23,000,000 slated for the downtown library by Measure S; each option requires additional fundraising, partnership with private sector, reduced scope, or something similar to bridge the shortfall.

The programming goals and service needs for the downtown library were determined by DLAC members, library staff, community members who attended the DLAC meetings, and various public surveys. The design goals for the library were determined by the services and desired physical features of the library. Each of the cost estimates in this document is a combination of construction expenses and service needs.

The architectural firm of Noll & Tam, with specialized expertise in remodeling, renovating, and new construction of public libraries costed the options, based on their knowledge of library construction and also on the design features prioritized by DLAC after the survey.

The *Measuring Measure S* website at [https://www.santacruzpl.org/measure\\_s/](https://www.santacruzpl.org/measure_s/) provides background on the library project. Additional documents including the detailed cost estimates from Noll & Tam are available on this website at [https://www.santacruzpl.org/measure\\_s/branch/7/documents/](https://www.santacruzpl.org/measure_s/branch/7/documents/).

## Option A: Partial Renovation of Existing Library

Option A is a proposed partial renovation of the existing downtown library building that is capped as close as possible to the \$23,000,000 funding provided by Measure S for the downtown library.

### Cost and Timing

- Estimated budget: \$24,620,958 - **Over budget by \$1,620,958**
  - Lowest initial construction cost with greatest future operating expenses)
- Does not include cost of a temporary library – Library would be closed during construction
- Shortest time period of 124 weeks with construction beginning April 2019

### Design and Services

- Addresses accessibility and seismic code compliance and remodels 36,000 s.f.
- Does not resolve many infrastructure problems
  - Remediation of roof problems not included in this estimate
  - Upgrades existing ventilation system but does not replace it with modern HVAC or provide air conditioning
  - Works around structural issues rather than designs for the future (For example, power needs addressed with wiring in floor-to-ceiling columns, rather than in-floor wiring)
  - More costly to operate due to workarounds of structural limitations rather than replacement of systems
  - Does not replace or increase size of existing windows (single-pane glass)
- Retains current location
  - Maintains integrity of Civic Complex (City Hall / Civic Center / Library area)
  - Reuses the current building
  - Provides adjacent parking (existing surface lot)
  - Accessible to public transit
- Does not provide the recommended 44,000 s.f.
  - 8,000 s.f. of existing library not part of the remodel and unavailable for public use
  - 20% smaller than the other options
- Smaller size prevents the library from meeting program goals including teen space, meeting rooms, study/tutoring spaces, and expanded computing without trade offs

### Security

- Does not fully address desire for increased security (consequence of preserving existing architectural footprint)
  - Building exterior essentially untouched
  - Main entrance not redesigned to decrease loitering or improve traffic flow
  - Hidden spaces and obscured sightlines caused by stairwell and power drops in columns are not mitigated
- Sightlines could be improved by position and size of stacks and location of help desk

## Option B: New Mixed-Use Construction

Option B is a new mixed-use construction project on the site of the existing Cedar Street surface lot behind the Logos building. This multi-story structure would be lower than the buildings on Pacific Avenue and would house both the library, a parking garage, and possibly affordable housing or office space. The needs of both the Farmer's Market and the Antique Faire are addressed in this option.

### Cost and Timing

- Estimated budget: \$26,674,381 - **Over budget by \$3,674,381**
  - This option provides the greatest number of desired program and design features for the amount of library funds invested
  - Exterior construction costs come from Parking Authority budget; library dollars spent on services and interior design
  - Requires a relationship with the Parking Authority; does not give library full control of design
- The project would take 188 weeks with construction beginning March 2020
- There are no additional costs for temporary relocation and little disruption of services

### Design and Services

- Solves infrastructure problems associated with the current building
- Does not retain current location of library
  - Breaks up the existing Civic Complex (City Hall / Civic Center / Library area)
  - Provides an additional asset for the city
  - Provides adjacent parking (new garage on existing surface lot)
  - Proximity to public transit
- Provides the recommended 44,000 s.f. and meets all library program goals including teen space, meeting rooms, study/tutoring spaces, and expanded computing
- Provides expanded design opportunities
  - Shared construction costs allow possibility of double-pane windows and additional natural light
  - Design constrained by a multi-use space (library and parking garage)
- Does not require increasing the number of existing parking spaces
  - Does not require expanding the number of parking lots; the proposed Cedar St. site is an existing surface parking lot
  - Will result in the loss of (non-heritage) trees currently located in the existing surface lot
- Relocates the Farmer's Market and Antique Faire to nearby downtown areas

### Security

- Fully addresses desire for increased security by allowing for purposeful architectural improvements that minimize loitering and improve traffic flow while eliminating hidden spaces and obscured sightlines caused by stairwell and columns in the existing library.

## Option C: Full Renovation of Existing Library

Option C renovates the existing downtown library building as much as possible while preserving the architectural footprint. It allows for reuse of the existing building and redesign of the interior by demolition of non-load bearing walls; construction and renovation are limited to prevent affecting the structural integrity and triggering seismic code retrofit.

### Cost and Timing

- Estimated budget: \$37,785,761 - **Over budget by \$14,785,761**
- The project would take 188 weeks with construction beginning March 2020
- Budget includes costs incurred by temporary relocation of collection and equipment; some patron interruption

### Design and Services

- Solves infrastructure problems associated with the current building
- Retains current location
  - Maintains integrity of Civic Complex (City Hall / Civic Center / Library area)
  - Reuses the current building
  - Provides adjacent parking (existing surface lot)
  - Accessible to public transit
- Provides the recommended 44,000 s.f. and meets all library program goals including teen space, meeting rooms, study/tutoring spaces, and expanded computing
- Provides expanded design opportunities
  - Limited by footprint of the existing building due to seismic code regulations
  - Allows possibility of double-pane windows and skylights
  - Window size, columns, and exterior must be retained due to seismic concerns

### Security

- Partially addresses desire for increased security (limited by preserving existing architectural footprint)
  - Enables some external security improvements
  - Although building footprint is preserved, entrance can be reoriented to discourage loitering
- Enables some internal security improvements
  - Sightlines improved by position and size of stacks and location of help desk
  - Hidden spaces and obscured sightlines caused by stairwell and power drops in columns are not mitigated

## Option D: New Construction on Existing Library Lot

Option D reuses the existing lot of the downtown library, but not the building itself. It attempts to maintain the integrity of the existing Civic Complex (City Hall / Civic Center / Library area) while meeting all the desired program goals and design features.

### Cost and Timing

- Estimated budget: \$49,313,846 - **Over budget by \$26,313,846**
- The project would take 188 weeks with construction beginning March 2020
- Budget includes costs incurred by temporary relocation of collection and equipment; some patron interruptions

### Design and Services

- Solves infrastructure problems associated with the current building
- Retains current location
  - Maintains integrity of Civic Complex (City Hall / Civic Center / Library area)
  - Provides adjacent parking (existing surface lot)
  - Accessible to public transit
- Provides the recommended 44,000 s.f. and meets all library program goals including teen space, meeting rooms, study/tutoring spaces, and expanded computing
- Provides the only option that allows for outdoor reading space, outdoor event/meeting space, and outdoor activity space (such as messy children's programming)
- Closure for remodel results in interruption of services
- Provides expanded design opportunities
  - Not limited by footprint of the existing building
  - Allows possibility of double-pane windows and skylights
- Incurs temporary relocation costs and disruption of services
  - The branch would need to be closed for the duration of the renovation and the collection moved
  - Some Downtown Branch resources would still be available for checkout at other branches

### Security

- Fully addresses desire for increased security by allowing for purposeful architectural improvements that minimize loitering and improve traffic flow while eliminating hidden spaces and obscured sightlines caused by stairwell and columns in the existing library.